



# Normalized Datasets of Zahn's, van Manen's, and Harnack's Greek Reconstructions of Marcion's *Apostolos*

MARK G. BILBY

JACK BULL

K. LANCE LOTHARP

\*Author affiliations can be found in the back matter of this article

COLLECTION:  
REPRESENTING THE  
ANCIENT WORLD  
THROUGH DATA

DATA PAPER

ubiquity press

## ABSTRACT

These six datasets are the first born-digital, normalized, lexicographically enriched, and peer-reviewed versions of Marcion's *Apostolos* as reconstructed respectively by Theodor Zahn, Willem Christiaan van Manen, and Adolf von Harnack. Two dataset files were generated for each reconstruction: the first consisting of human-readable Postclassical Greek; the second of lemmatized and morphologically tagged text following the openly licensed BibleWorks Greek Morphology. These datasets represent another batch in a series of normalized and enriched datasets of major reconstructions of Marcion's scriptures published by *JOHD*.

## CORRESPONDING AUTHOR:

**Mark G. Bilby**

Independent Researcher,  
Kansas City, US

[mgb8n@virginia.edu](mailto:mgb8n@virginia.edu)

## KEYWORDS:

Apostolos; Apostolikon;  
Apostle Paul; Paul of  
Tarsus; Marcion of Sinope;  
computational linguistics;  
postclassical Greek

## TO CITE THIS ARTICLE:

Bilby, M. G., Bull, J., & Lotharp, K. L. (2023). Normalized Datasets of Zahn's, van Manen's, and Harnack's Greek Reconstructions of Marcion's *Apostolos*. *Journal of Open Humanities Data*, 9: 21, pp. 1–5. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5334/johd.122>

## (1) OVERVIEW

Repository location: DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7910/DVN/ZUVKQW>

Morphology key: Bilby, M.G. (2021a). *Key to BibleWorks Greek Morphology (BGM)* (v1.1). DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4950243>

Print sources:

Harnack, A. von (1924). *Marcion: Das Evangelium vom fremden Gott* (2nd ed.). Leipzig: J.C. Hinrichs. ARK: <https://n2t.net/ark:/13960/t3611sv4v>

Manen, W. C. van (1887). Marcion's brief van Paulus aan de Galatiërs. *Theologisch Tijdschrift* 21, 382–404, 451–533. ARK: <https://n2t.net/ark:/13960/s28vzvsnq4>

Zahn, T. (1892). *Geschichte des neutestamentlichen Kanons* (Vol. 2). Erlangen: Andreas Deichert. ARK: <https://n2t.net/ark:/13960/t8cf9s958>

## CONTEXT

Three major Greek scholarly reconstructions of the corpus of Marcion's *Apostolos* have appeared in print over the last century and a half, namely those by Theodor Zahn (1892: 495–529), Adolf von Harnack (1924: 67–127), and Ulrich Schmid (1995: 315–344). All of these editions offset a thorough, readable Greek text, however discontinuous at many points. An offset, largely continuous Greek text of *Apostolos* Galatians was first published by Willem Christiaan van Manen (1887: 528–533). These works all additionally include secondary analysis.

Other scholarly works have examined the corpus or portions of the *Apostolos* without presenting a clear, thorough, offset Greek text. Hilgenfeld undertook the first meticulous analysis of *Apostolos* Galatians (1852: 218–234), followed by a later examination of the *Apostolos* corpus (1855: 439–463), yet both are unwieldy hodgepodes of critical commentary, piecemeal Greek reconstructions, Latin attestations, and scholarly cross-references. Karl Theodor Schäfer (1939) compiled lists of Old Latin readings for Galatians, including attestations to Marcion's *Apostolos* by Tertullian. Hermann Raschke (1926) arranged an annotated catena of Epiphanius' Greek scholia on *Apostolos* Galatians, 1–2 Corinthians, and Romans. John J. Clabeaux (1989) assembled a succession of well-organized entries, collating attestations of *Apostolos* wording against manuscript and patristic citation variants for the canonical texts.

The most recent published reconstruction of the *Apostolos* corpus was the English-only edition by Jason BeDuhn (2013), which notes patristic attestations and corresponding canonical manuscript variants in well-organized endnotes. Markus Vinzent is making final refinements to his fully continuous, philologically-rigorous Greek reconstruction of the *Apostolos* corpus, together with an accompanying German translation, both slated for publication late in 2023 or early 2024. Vinzent's reconstruction has been translated into English by Mark G. Bilby and edited by Jack Bull in a work already pre-released as an iterative open science book (2023) and invited for submission to an academic press.

These reconstructions variously make use of an eclectic array of evidence, including Latin attestations by Tertullian and Rufinus (in a liberal translation of Origen), Greek attestations by Epiphanius and the Ps-Origen *Adamantius Dialogue*, Syriac attestations by Ephrem, as well as variants in Greek, Latin, and Syriac manuscripts of the canonical letters of Paul.

Four data papers and 12 accompanying datasets in this journal (Bilby 2021b; Bilby 2021c; Bilby 2021d; Bilby 2021e) were the first peer-reviewed, normalized, digital, and enriched Greek texts of Marcion's *Evangelion* to be published. The present data paper and accompanying six datasets are the first reborn digital texts published of Marcion's *Apostolos*.

## (2) METHOD

### CHALLENGES AND RESOLUTIONS

The creation and normalization of *Evangelion* datasets started with the print edition of Harnack (1924) because it is in the public domain and has been the standard reconstruction of that text for most of the past century. Harnack's deeply ambiguous typographical indications and editorial tendencies presented a special challenge and optimal opportunity to create data

normalization/regularization rules, to define a few encompassing datatypes, and to utilize two simple typographical symbols, all to distill a tokenizable text amenable to scientific analysis and cross-comparison by humans and machines.

The resulting datatypes are: 1) plain text for clearly restored wording, no matter the relative directness or clarity of the attestation, so long as the wording is not indicated as unlikely or dubious; 2) text within parentheses for lower confidence wording, for the more likely of different variants, and for contextually necessary wording; 3) text within square brackets for implied or improvised content corresponding to the standard New Testament critical edition of the time, usually the *Editio Octava Critica Maior* of Tischendorf (1872); 4) empty parentheses () for lacunae, ellipses, unclear content, and highly dubious content; and 5) empty square brackets [] to indicate variant(s) for one or more preceding words.

The same basic normalization rules previously applied to Harnack's *Evangelion* and detailed in a previous data paper (Bilby, 2021b) are here applied to his *Apostolos*. A few tendencies particular to Harnack's reconstruction of the *Apostolos* did present some additional considerations. For example, Harnack added brief concluding paragraphs after most letters of the *Apostolos*, in these summaries typically detailing particular omissions he purports Marcion had made. The previously developed rules called for most unattested wording to be omitted without any indication, and these concluding summaries proved more confirmatory than complicating. At several points in *Apostolos* Philippians and elsewhere, Harnack cross-references content from the apocryphal Epistle to the Laodiceans, for which he subsequently laid out Latin and Greek texts (1924: 137–140). In keeping with the previously developed normalization rules, such cross-references were treated akin to footnotes, substituted with empty parentheses rather than treated as prompts to restore clear or even implicit wording. At some points, the main text of Harnack's *Apostolos* includes unusual notes that verses “were unattested, but would not have been absent” / *sind unbezeugt, aber werden nicht gefehlt haben* (1924: 72). Similar observations are strewn across the footnotes of Harnack's *Evangelion*, but here the indications within the running text merit the restoration of corresponding wording drawn from Tischendorf's edition, yet set within square brackets as improvised rather than explicitly restored.

The normalization rules previously developed for Zahn's *Evangelion* and detailed in a previous data paper (Bilby, 2021d) held up well without any challenges particular to his *Apostolos*.

No prior normalization rules were developed for van Manen (1887), because he did not publish a reconstruction of the *Evangelion*. However, his reconstruction of the *Apostolos* is typographically simple. He uses ellipses for unknown portions of the text, and these lacunae are normalized as empty parentheses. Van Manen also places some words and some verse numbers in parentheses, but does not introduce or explain what these indications entail. A close reading suggests that parentheses can variously signify: notable differences of the Marcionite text (which van Manen believed to reflect earlier traditions oftentimes) from the canonical version; disagreement among witnesses to the Marcionite text; uncertainty about the wording; and/or a different order of a verse or group of words than that found in the canonical text. While van Manen's order is preserved, normalized verse numbering is used and some verse subdivisions are imposed so as to conform to the other *Apostolos* editions. Parentheses around words are preserved as is.

Given the public domain status of all three underlying print works, their close relationships and overlapping data, and the lack of any previously published, reborn digital versions, these texts together make a formidable basis for a first batch of *Apostolos* datasets.

## QUALITY AND VERSION CONTROL

In keeping with the *Evangelion* data papers previously published in *JOHD*, here also the first dataset of each reconstruction consists of normalized, human-readable Greek, while the second lemmatizes each word and appends part-of-speech and morphological tags based on the BibleWorks Greek Morphology (BGM). The transcription and tagging involved about 80 hours of manual work by Bilby, using interlinear compilations of various *Apostolos* editions and morphologically tagged canonical datasets to facilitate pattern matching and rapid tag application. Lemma and word form lookups and confirmations were performed as needed using the BibleWorks software then the Thesaurus Linguae Graecae. Quality control checks of the transcription and this data paper were subsequently made by Jack Bull. Quality control of

the BGM-tagged data was performed by K. Lance Lotharp, who ran custom R code to check for comprehensiveness of coverage in the part-of-speech and morphological tagging, and then by Bilby, who used a blend of regex queries, Notepad++ plugins, Winmerge, and Excel sort and filter routines to find, review, and correct anomalous lemmata and tags.

If any errors are discovered in the data after peer-review and publication, these will be corrected with updated dataset versions and/or with data-wrangling code at the team's open access repository at Github.<sup>1</sup> Exploratory meetings have already taken place to build collaborations with larger Classical and Postclassical Greek corpus linguistics projects so as to transform these datasets into other formats, especially TEI-XML.

### (3) DATASET DESCRIPTION

*Object name:* Normalized Datasets of Zahn's, van Manen's, and Harnack's Reconstructions of Marcion's *Apostolos*

*Format names and versions:* UTF-8 encoded.txt

*Creation dates:* 2023-05-17/2023-07-22

#### DATASET CREATORS

Mark G. Bilby (PhD, University of Virginia) manually created all datasets. Jack Bull (PhD, King's College London) provided quality control of the transcriptions. K. Lance Lotharp (Columbia University) and Bilby ran quality control checks of the lemmatized and morphologically tagged datasets.

*Languages:* Postclassical Greek. English

*License:* CC BY-NC-ND 4.0 international

*Repository name:* Journal of Open Humanities Data Dataverse

*Publication date:* 2023-08-10

### (4) REUSE POTENTIAL

These normalized versions of the three public domain Greek scholarly reconstructions of Marcion's *Apostolos* build on the prior batch of open datasets of Marcion's *Evangelion* published in *JOHD* and commence a new batch of datasets of past and forthcoming editions of the *Apostolos*. These datasets may prove pivotal to future scholarship, especially to resource quantitative, comparative analyses of the Marcionite scriptures and their canonical counterparts. Like the *Evangelion*, the *Apostolos* has been suppressed for eighteen centuries, but data science holds considerable potential to restore it to previously unattainable levels of completeness and confidence, and concurrently to clarify its historical and literary relationships with their canonical counterparts and various other writings attributed to, or treating of, the Apostle Paul.

The team's choice of a CC BY-NC-ND license is not intended to prevent re-use, but instead to build collaborative research networks and resources around these texts. We welcome interested parties to reach out to the corresponding author to request permissions.

### COMPETING INTERESTS

The authors have no competing interests to declare.

### AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

**Mark G. Bilby:** Project administration; Conceptualization; Methodology; Data curation; Writing – original draft; Writing – review & editing.

**Jack Bull:** Data curation; Writing – review & editing.

**K. Lance Lotharp:** Data curation; Software; Validation; Writing – review & editing.

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://github.com/mgbilby/SRC-OA> (Last accessed: 23 October 2023).

## AUTHOR AFFILIATIONS

**Mark G. Bilby**  [orcid.org/0000-0003-0100-6634](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0100-6634)

Independent Researcher, Kansas City, US

**Jack Bull**  [orcid.org/0000-0003-4606-239X](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4606-239X)

St Mary's University, Twickenham, London, UK

**K. Lance Lotharp**  [orcid.org/0000-0003-0797-2710](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0797-2710)

Columbia University, New York, US

AuthorName  
Journal of Open  
Humanities Data  
DOI: 10.5334/johd.122

5

## REFERENCES

- BeDuhn, J.** (2013). *The First New Testament*. Salem: Polebridge. ARK: <https://n2t.net/ark:/13960/s2m7q24b0n0>
- Bilby, M. G.** (2021a). *Key to BibleWorks Greek Morphology* (v1.1). DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4950243>
- Bilby, M. G.** (2021b). Normalized Datasets of Harnack's Reconstruction of Marcion's Gospel. *Journal of Open Humanities Data*, 7(24), 1–7. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5334/johd.47>
- Bilby, M. G.** (2021c). Normalized Datasets of Roth's Reconstruction of Marcion's Gospel. *Journal of Open Humanities Data*, 7(27), 1–6. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5334/johd.57>
- Bilby, M. G.** (2021d). Normalized Datasets of Hahn's and Zahn's Reconstructions of Marcion's Gospel. *Journal of Open Humanities Data*, 7(31), 1–5. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5334/johd.63>
- Bilby, M. G.** (2021e). Normalized Datasets of Klinghardt's and Nicolotti's Reconstructions of Marcion's Gospel. *Journal of Open Humanities Data*, 7(32), 1–6. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5334/johd.70>
- Bilby, M. G.** (2023). *Paul's Literary Metamorphosis: Translations of Marcion's Apostolos and Canonical Counterparts* (J. Bull, ed.). LODLIB v1.01. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.8271824>
- Clabeaux, J. J.** (1989). *A Lost Edition of the Letters of Paul: A Reassessment of the Text of the Pauline Corpus attested by Marcion*. Washington, DC: Catholic Biblical Association of America.
- Harnack, A. von.** (1924). *Marcion: Das Evangelium vom fremden Gott* (2nd ed.). Leipzig: J. C. Hinrichs. ARK: <https://n2t.net/ark:/13960/t3611sv4v>
- Hilgenfeld, A.** (1852). Anhang 2: Marcion's Text des Galaterbriefs. *Der Galaterbrief*. Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel. ARK: <https://n2t.net/ark:/13960/t31262302>
- Hilgenfeld, A.** (1855). Das Apostolikon Marcions. *Zeitschrift für die historische Theologie*, 25, 426–484. ARK: <https://n2t.net/ark:/13960/s2k8jc8fdt2>
- Manen, W. C. van.** (1887). Marcion's brief van Paulus aan de Galatiërs. *Theologisch Tijdschrift*, 21, 382–404, 451–533. ARK: <https://n2t.net/ark:/13960/s28vzvnnq4>
- Raschke, H.** (1926). Der Römerbrief des Markion nach Epiphanius. *Schriften der Bremer Wissenschaftlichen Gesellschaft: Reihe D: Abhandlungen und Vorträge* (pp. 128–201). Bremen: Carl Schünemann Verlag.
- Schäfer, K. Th.** (1939). Die Überlieferung des atlantischen Galaterbriefes. *Personal- und Vorlesungs-Verzeichnis* (pp. 1–40). Braunschweig: Bibliothek der Staatliche Akademie.
- Schmid, U.** (1995). *Marcion und sein Apostolos: Rekonstruktion und historische Einordnung der marcionitischen Paulusbriefausgabe*. Berlin: de Gruyter. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110889345>
- Tischendorf, C.** (1872). *Novum Testamentum Graece* (Vol. 2). Leipzig: Giesecke & Devrient. ARK: <https://n2t.net/ark:/13960/t17m0wj5s>
- Zahn, T.** (1892). *Geschichte des neutestamentlichen Kanons* (Vol. 2, Pt. 2). Erlangen: Andreas Deichert. ARK: <https://n2t.net/ark:/13960/t8cf9s958>

### TO CITE THIS ARTICLE:

Bilby, M. G., Bull, J., & Lotharp, K. L. (2023). Normalized Datasets of Zahn's, van Manen's, and Harnack's Greek Reconstructions of Marcion's Apostolos. *Journal of Open Humanities Data*, 9: 21, pp. 1–5. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5334/johd.122>

**Submitted:** 22 July 2023

**Accepted:** 17 October 2023

**Published:** 10 November 2023

### COPYRIGHT:

© 2023 The Author(s). This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC-BY 4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited. See <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>.

*Journal of Open Humanities Data* is a peer-reviewed open access journal published by Ubiquity Press.